

# AGENDA Innovation and Online Committee By Telephone Conference Call Tallahassee, FL June 9, 2014 1:00 p.m.

Dial-in Number: 1-888-670-3525 Conference Code: 4122150353#

Chair: Mr. Ned Lautenbach; Vice Chair: Mr. Ed Morton Members: Beard, Chopra, Colson, Kuntz, Link, Stewart, Tripp

**Governor Ned Lautenbach** 

Call to Order and Opening Remarks

1.

2. Approval, Committee Meeting Minutes

Minutes, May 8, 2014

Governor Lautenbach

3. Discussion Regarding May 8, 2014, Committee Governor Lautenbach Meeting

4. Concluding Remarks and Adjournment Governor Lautenbach

# STATE UNIVERSITY SYSTEM OF FLORIDA BOARD OF GOVERNORS Innovation and Online Committee

June 09, 2014

**SUBJECT:** Approval of Minutes of Meeting held May 8, 2014

# **PROPOSED COMMITTEE ACTION**

Approval of minutes of meeting held on May 8, 2014.

# **AUTHORITY FOR BOARD OF GOVERNORS ACTION**

Article IX, Section 7, Florida Constitution

# **BACKGROUND INFORMATION**

Board members will review and approve the minutes of the meeting held on May 8, 2014.

Supporting Documentation Included: Minutes: May 8, 2014

Facilitators/Presenters: Governor Ned Lautenbach

# MINUTES STATE UNIVERSITY SYSTEM OF FLORIDA BOARD OF GOVERNORS INNOVATION AND ONLINE COMMITTEE MAY 8, 2014

### 1. Call to Order and Opening Remarks

Chair Ned Lautenbach convened the meeting of the Innovation and Online Committee at 8:32 a.m. on May 8, 2014, with the following members present and answering roll call: Vice Chair Ed Morton, Dick Beard, Manoj Chopra (participating by phone), and Pam Stewart (participating by phone) and Norm Tripp. A quorum was established.

Committee member Wendy Link joined the meeting at 9:08 am. Other Board members in attendance were Carlo Fassi and H. Wayne Huizenga, Jr.

### 2. Opening Remarks

Chair Lautenbach thanked Florida Gulf Coast University for hosting the meeting and recognized President Wilson G. Bradshaw and the Chairman of the Board of Trustees, Robbie Roepstorff for comments.

Chair Lautenbach announced that a representative from the University of Georgia System would be attending the next meeting of the Innovation and Online Committee to share that system's experience with adopting and implementing a common learning management system across their university system.

## 3. <u>University Online Education Presentations</u>

### a. Florida Gulf Coast University

Chair Lautenbach introduced Dr. Ronald Toll, Provost and Vice President of Academic Affairs at Florida Gulf Coast University.

Dr. Toll said that the organizational structure of online education is centered in the office of the Provost, and each college provides some online learning opportunities. As part of a strategic planning process, the university is contemplating the creation of a new office that will bring all of the services and entities for online education under one director.

Of FGCU's total program inventory, 13% is available completely online. Except for the Transitional Doctor of Physical Therapy, which is offered at market rate, the programs are state funded.

The university uses the same process for approving new programs for face-to-face, online, and blended delivery. All proposals for new programs are reviewed by the Council of Academic Vice Presidents (CAVP) Workgroup.

Chair Lautenbach asked if the university has a strategic plan for online education. Dr. Toll said FGCU has established a strategic planning group to develop a plan for online learning.

Mr. Beard asked if FGCU creates its own courses or purchase courses. Dr. Toll said the vast majority are created by the faculty and instructional designers at the university.

Dr. Toll said there are no additional fees or costs for online learning at FGCU. Tuition and fees are the same for online and on-campus courses, with the exception of the program that charges market rate tuition.

He said that undergraduate sections have been growing while growth in graduate sections has remained relatively flat. Over 12 years, FGCU has had a 700% increase in online learning FTE. Graduate programs have utilized online learning, but the university is now looking at substantially increasing utilization of the online modality at the undergraduate level. The university is increasing FTE and credit hours in online courses without unnecessarily creating new sections, which demonstrates efficiency.

Dr. Toll indicated that courses and programs are reviewed internally and externally for quality assurance. Master's degree programs are fully accredited by multiple accrediting bodies. An internal audit reviewed a number of features related to online learning, including the number of courses taught by full-time faculty, course enrollment and student grades. The Sloan Online Scorecard is used to review academic support.

Chair Lautenbach asked what they learned on the internal audit. Dr. Toll said they learned that many courses are blended, not fully online. Based on this, the transition to fully online may not be as difficult as originally thought. Also, there is congruence in satisfaction between students in online, blended, and face-to-face courses.

Dr. Toll said that fully online students at FGCU are non-traditional students and live off campus. A large majority are transfer students and graduate students.

Annually, 70% of students take at least one online course, compared to 41% statewide and 31% nationally.

The university has implemented a new learning management system, Canvas, which better supports online learning than the prior system.

Dr. Toll said that faculty training is available but not required.

Vice Chair Morton noted that universities, generally, are charging more for online learning and asked if costs would come down as universities become better at delivering online courses. Dr. Toll said published reports indicate costs are different, but not necessarily less, and the benefit of online learning is providing greater access.

Mr. Morton asked to what extent universities were cooperating with each other regarding online education in order to remove unnecessary duplication. Dr. Toll gave two examples of such cooperation in the system; the CAVP Academic Coordination Project and UF Online.

Vice Chair Morton asked if there were efforts underway at FGCU or elsewhere in the system where competencies were being used in ways that may be played out in the future, such as giving credit for skills obtained in jobs. Dr. Toll said there were conversations being held on

competencies in both face-to-face programs and online programs. He believes conversations locally, statewide, and nationally will lead to some uniform understanding about how higher education can embrace competency-based education more fully.

Mr. Fassi asked how the university determined which students were taking courses strictly online. Dr. Toll responded that most data systems do not easily capture data about students who are taking online courses, so the university had to review past student records and data from the learning management system to have an understanding of its online students. It will be necessary for all institutions to have a better understanding of their online students in the future.

Mr. Fassi asked if the university charged distance learning fees and Dr. Toll said the university does not. Mr. Fassi then asked if the university waived fees for students enrolled only in online courses, such as fees for campus facilities or services provided on campus. Dr. Toll said the university has not looked at waiving fees for students who take only online courses. The question of fees for online students is part of a broader debate which needs to be held.

### b. University of West Florida

Chair Lautenbach introduced Dr. Pam Northrup, Associate Provost at the University of West Florida.

Dr. Northrup indicated that online degree programs are housed under the Associate Provost, Academic Innovation & Innovation Institute, which is the position she holds. The university purchases some resources, like textbooks, but typically the content of courses is developed inhouse.

On average, 43% of student FTE are in online courses. The trend is for more students to enroll in online courses in the summer; last year, 57% of student FTE were in online courses provided during the summer. Online enrollment is largest during the summer because the university markets this option to its residential students.

At the baccalaureate level, 16% of programs are online and 44% of Master's degree programs are fully online. The local military population has a strong demand for graduate degree programs. The university is adding a Master's degree program in Cybersecurity, but the focus is on growing existing programs more fully, not adding new programs. The university also offers certificate programs online which can rapidly meet industry demands.

At UWF, 50% of all students take at least one online course.

While graduates in fully online programs have steadily increased over the years, UWF has found that students taking face-to-face courses on campus will also take courses online.

The university charges a distance learning fee which is \$15 per credit hour. Funding has been used to pay for the learning management system, faculty training, and other tools that support online learning. The university has been approved for market rate in four programs beginning next year.

The university uses the same process to develop online courses as on-campus courses. Early on, the process was driven by faculty. In the last seven or eight years, only degree programs with a

local, regional, state or national demand are being developed for online delivery. Ensuring adequate resources for developing the course and an agreement that faculty will participate in training are additional factors that are considered.

In deciding whether to use state funding or a self-sustaining model, the university considers demand, particularly among non-traditional and out-of-state students; whether the market will bear the cost; scalability; and how the earned revenue will be used.

The law requires the university to explore reduced costs for distance learning as part of Complete Florida. In November, the university will deliver a report to the Chancellors of the State University System and the Florida College System that will provide a variety of options for distance learning based on models across the country, such as how others have addressed competency-based education and other strategies to accelerate completion, how they have collaborated with others, and how they have shared resources.

The university offers training in designing and teaching an online course and uses Quality Matters, a nationally recognized metric for evaluating online courses, to help faculty continuously improve their existing courses.

Performance measures include institutional alignment, cost, quality curriculum, faculty support, student experience and continuous improvement.

The goals are increasing enrollment to 50% in fully online programs, testing transformative models that reduce costs, providing an excellent student experience, connecting graduates to the workforce, and maintaining excellence in all online programs and courses. The University of West Florida has been having conversations with its accrediting body, the Southern Association of Colleges and Schools, about the competency-based program which it is developing and plans to offer in fall 2015. As part of Complete Florida, the university is streamlining the admissions process and will offer concierge-based coaching.

Ms. Link asked how closely the university worked with the local state colleges on the development and offering of certificate programs to avoid duplication. Dr. Northrup said the university tries to work closely with state colleges. State colleges are participating in the development of Complete Florida. She also said the state colleges offer industry-based certificates, while the university offers post-baccalaureate certificate programs.

Ms. Link emphasized the importance of coordinating with state colleges in the development of online courses, similar to the established process for traditional campus programs. Dr. Northup said Dr. Judy Bense, President of the University of West Florida, meets regularly with local state college presidents.

Vice Chair Morton said, based on his research, that scalability and a bright line of differentiation between institutions will help avoid duplication and bring greater efficiency to the system.

Vice Chair Morton asked if the cost for in-state and out-of-state students was different. Dr. Northrup said tuition for out-of-state students is higher, but the university has the ability to waive a percentage of fees for fully online, out-of-state students. The university also has the ability to offer differential fees to students in Alabama, because the institution is only eleven miles from the Alabama border.

Vice Chair Morton asked how the university is looking for ways to reduce cost. Dr. Northrup said prior learning assessments and competency-based education are two ways that will allow students to reduce the time and cost of earning a degree.

### c. Florida Atlantic University

Chair Lautenbach introduced Dr. Victoria Brown, Assistant Provost of eLearning at Florida Atlantic University.

Dr. Brown said that the Center for eLearning is under the Provost and provides professional development, support and design services to faculty and staff. Support services for online students are embedded in the units; online students and on-campus students, many of whom are non-traditional, are served the same way. Colleges manage the online degree programs.

Courses are classified as distance, hybrid, and on-campus. Students in hybrid classes have the option to attend class on campus, watch the live video conferencing, or watch a recording at their convenience. The university is considering recoding their classes to more accurately depict what they are doing. Students who are distance learners are charged a fee for distance learning.

Until recently, the focus has been on connecting with students and faculty across multiple campuses. The university is just starting to look at offering programs to students outside the region. The university currently offers two fully online programs and will add six more in the fall. Several more programs are in development.

The university is taking a systematic approach, using workforce data, marketing analysis and their niche courses and programs, to determine what programs and courses to offer online. Departments that want to put their programs online must meet a market feasibility analysis.

The university uses the market-based application and is exploring other self-sustaining options. A Master's in Business Administration is offered at market rate and the university has just approved a type of in-house market rate for an online baccalaureate business degree program. Other colleges at the university have asked that market rate be explored for them, but have expressed concern that out-of-state tuition is cost prohibitive.

The university charges a distance learning fee as well as campus fees. This fall, the university will reevaluate the fees for online students.

The university has four levels of faculty development and is establishing a badging system for faculty who complete all of them. Based on an evaluation of the training program, the approach is shifting from training faculty to design their own courses to designing the courses for faculty.

The university uses a number of performance measures, including quantity of courses and programs, student enrollment, productivity of the Center for eLearning, and quality of courses.

Dr. Chopra asked if research shows differences in the learning of students online and on-campus students. Dr. Brown said extensive research on the different modalities of learning shows the instructional strategies of the course impacts the learning outcomes, regardless of the delivery method.

This fall, the university will launch a website to serve as a one-stop-shop for student services. Also, the university is launching research-based communities of practice; the idea is to develop best practices for the different modalities of delivery. The university plans to expand access to its programs worldwide, especially for nontraditional students, and create a research focus within the Center for eLearning to enhance learning outcomes.

Dr. Brown indicated that a shared platform would allow for more efficiency in sharing resources across the university system.

Chair Lautenbach asked if FAU had a strategic plan or if the move to online learning was all bottom-up. Dr. Brown said the university is putting a committee together this summer and will be launching a more systematic approach in the fall.

Chair Lautenbach asked if they conducted marketing. She said they are developing a plan for marketing.

Ms. Link asked about the university's approach to out-of-state tuition. Dr. Brown said the university is exploring a fee waiver approach for some programs, and would make sure the market would bear the tuition levels that would be charged.

d. Florida Agricultural and Mechanical University

Chair Lautenbach recognized Ms. Franzeta Fitz, Director, Instructional Technology at FAMU.

Ms. Fitz said the university's strategic plan requires the development and implementation of a comprehensive distance learning program.

In spring 2011, FAMU was one of just two colleges in Florida's state university system that did not offer an online degree program. In fall 2011, the university successfully launched three online graduate degree programs.

The university's distance learning programs are managed through the Office of Instructional Technology, which is under the Office of Academic Affairs.

The three online programs were selected based on workforce data and student demand. Since the launch of the programs, 142 students have enrolled and 48 have graduated. In spring 2012, the university launched general education courses and since that time 1,526 students have enrolled in these courses.

The university plans to increase student enrollment, expand the offering of general education courses, emphasize STEM disciplines, and use the brand to attract students in underserved populations from around the nation.

The university chose the self-supporting model for its three online programs because it was the only way to make the programs financially viable at the time they were launched. However, the significant cost to students is a challenge for expanding enrollment. The cost of the Master in Business Administration is \$34,850, Master in Public Health is \$32,500 and Master of Science in Nursing is \$30,750.

Undergraduate courses have the same cost as traditional courses. The tuition model for future online undergraduate degree programs anticipates state funding. The budget recently approved by the Legislature provides one-time funding to support expansion of online graduate degree programs and development of online baccalaureate degree programs at the university. Ms. Fitz said that development of undergraduate programs and courses will allow the university to increase enrollment and graduation rates and pursue plans to join the Complete Florida initiative.

Ms. Fitz said that the faculty development program is modeled on Quality Matters. Before teaching online, faculty must complete a program with instruction in the learning management system, pedagogy, student services, test proctoring and teaching practicum. Faculty must recertify every two years.

Key performance measures include enrollment, retention, graduation rates, feedback, and career advancement.

She said that the university also offers a mobile learning app that provides access to student services, library, and the learning management system which offers access to courses and content for students and faculty.

Vice Chair Morton cautioned all of the universities about the challenge of price elasticity as competition for online degrees increases. He asked if the graduate programs had out-of-state tuition. Ms. Fitz said students in-state and out-of-state pay the same amount.

### e. University of South Florida

Chair Lautenbach recognized Dr. Ralph Wilcox, USF Provost and Executive Vice President. Dr. Wilcox introduced Beth Garland, Director of Innovative Education.

Dr. Wilcox said that Innovative Education is a fully self-supporting, shared services program for students, as well the home for the continuing education, not-for-credit programs. Innovative Education reports to the Provost for Academic Affairs.

Innovative Education does not utilize state funding. It is funded exclusively through market-based tuition, distance learning fees, and cost recovery.

Dr. Wilcox said that Innovative Education works in partnership with the 13 colleges across the university to identify, select, design, deliver and evaluate online courses. Innovative Education is also responsible for compliance and reporting of distance education for all USF entities.

Innovative Education focuses on three populations: traditional or "native" students, non-traditional students or "completers," and discreet cohorts to meet specific workforce needs, specifically in information technology, cybersecurity and healthcare sectors in the region.

He said that Innovative Education provides faculty development for online delivery, authentication and testing, instructional design and media innovation, market research and marketing, and compliance. Innovative Education also provides 24/7 technology and library

support, as well as graduate teaching assistants added incrementally when enrollment exceeds 75 students in a course.

The unit handles all state authorizations. The university is authorized to offer programs in 46 states. Participation in the remaining states - Iowa, Maryland, Minnesota and Oregon - is cost-prohibitive.

Chair Lautenbach asked why these states were cost-prohibitive. Ms. Garland said some states require the programs to carry a bond and in other cases the state charges a per student participation fee.

Of USF's degree programs, 17% are offered fully online, including 13 undergraduate degree programs and 36 graduate degree programs. All general education requirements can be met online. In 2013-14, nearly 3000 sections were delivered and over 100,000 "seats" were filled. Those numbers would be higher if hybrid or blended courses were added.

Ms. Link asked how many first-time-in-college students were fully online. Dr. Wilcox said they only recently added an attribute in the student information system to count fully online first-time-in-college students. Next year, the university will be able to report that data. He said, anecdotally, the percentage was small but rapidly growing, including significant growth in high school students taking dual enrollment courses.

Online enrollment has grown over the last several years and is expected to exceed 300,000 student credit hours this year. Enrollment in online courses increased from 17% of total student credit hours in 2008-2009 to 24% in 2012-2013.

Individual courses are selected for online delivery based on unmet demand for courses that are required for students to accelerate their path to graduation. Full programs are selected for online delivery based on employer demand in the marketplace. Gauging faculty expertise to deliver a quality program is the next factor.

In courses funded by state appropriations, out-of-state students are charged more to ensure the benefits of state investment remain within the state. In courses not funded by state tax dollars, a cost recovery model allows higher costs for residents and lower costs for non-residents as long as the total cost of delivery is covered. The market rate model generates revenue beyond the cost of delivery.

Vice Chair Morton asked if the university had considered MOOCs and providers to drive costs down. Dr. Wilcox said USF has delivered small numbers of MOOCs, and he is concerned about the business model. In addition, completion rates are unacceptably low for MOOCs. He said they will continue to evaluate MOOCs, as well as the use of third-party providers.

Vice Chair Morton asked if the university envisioned outsourcing. Dr. Wilcox said the university was evaluating these opportunities. He said USF already works with third-party providers in areas where the university does not currently have the expertise that matches that of the providers.

The university charges \$50 per credit hour distance learning fees for both graduate and undergraduate students, but fully online students do not pay health fees, activity and service fees, athletics fees, transportation fees, or student center fees.

Mr. Tripp asked if faculty can serve more students online than face-to-face to reduce cost, and does USF know the savings today and what they will be in the future. Dr. Wilcox said online courses can grow incrementally in ways that face-to-face courses cannot grow because of space restrictions. USF makes additional investments to ensure that the level of interaction between students and faculty is not diminished.

All online instructors must complete a faculty development course for online learning. All new faculty participate in a week-long orientation, a growing portion of which is dedicated to online learning.

To measure performance, the university established a rubric, based largely on Quality Matters.

Next steps include modular delivery of courses, global classrooms, mobile-ready courses, secure proctoring and authentication, and competency-based education. The first mobile course was launched last spring. Serving the veteran population may be the focus of competency-based education.

Mr. Tripp asked if the university is collaborating with other institutions. Dr. Wilcox said the universities are working together in selecting programs and developing approaches to proctoring, but collaboration in other areas could improve.

Chancellor Criser asked about the benefits of creating a statewide system with open access and discounted residential tuition, while expanding the 2+2 construct to obtain economies of scale. There may be artificial barriers that are keeping the system from being better players in the state and nationally. Dr. Wilcox said he believed the best approach was to build on existing strengths at all twelve universities to encourage innovation. He suggested that the State University System could broaden the array of general education courses online and make the articulation and transfer process more seamless for students. The majority of USF online students are within 100 miles of campus.

### f. University of Florida

Chair Lautenbach recognized Dr. Joseph Glover, Provost and Senior Vice President of Academic Affairs, who introduced Dr. Andy McCollough, Associate Provost for Teaching and Technology.

Dr. Glover said his presentation was focused on providing higher education at a distance, not the impact of academic technologies on residential degree programs and classroom instruction. He said the recent focus on baccalaureate programs in UF Online has obscured the fact that UF has been involved in distance education for decades and offers both credit and noncredit programs. He provided an overview of the organizational structure of UF Online.

The University of Florida offers 51 online degree programs, which increases to 94 when majors and specializations are included. Most online degree programs are at the Master's level, but the undergraduate programs are growing rapidly as a result of legislative direction last year.

UF Online currently offers 11online programs, including the migration of several existing online 2+2 completion programs. The intent is to bring five or six more programs online each year. Total enrollment is about 600, including 100 new students. Enrollment is expected to grow to 24,000 in ten years.

Additional programs have been selected based on workforce data, student demand, and the technical ability to deliver courses and degree programs online.

Mr. Tripp asked if there is a group working together to solve the challenge with offering labs. Dr. Glover said he was not aware of an SUS effort, but the University of Florida has Institute of Food and Agricultural Sciences facilities all over the state, as well as partnerships with state colleges. Online students may also be required to come to the University of Florida campus for a series of intense lab courses in the summer.

Because the state articulation agreement allows seamless transfer of credits, the development of online general education curriculum by UF could reduce duplication of course production. Dual enrollment is also being provided through UF Online to expand access to high school students.

Research in online education is a huge academic and revenue opportunity. The university is investing in research on adaptive and personalized learning.

While online baccalaureate degree programs are new, online graduate degree programs have been in existence for some time. There are 83 online graduate degree programs with 7000 students. Last year, the programs generated \$82 million in gross revenue.

The university considers market research, student demand, cost recovery, and workforce and state critical needs to determine degree programs to offer online.

UF Online is state funded. Under the law, tuition for in-state students cannot exceed 75% of normal residential tuition. Tuition for out-of-state students is market-rate and determined by the program. Vice Chair Morton asked if the differential between the in-state and out-of-state tuition is the same. Dr. McCollough said different programs have different tuition based on what the market will bear.

Fully online graduate degree programs are self-funded. Revenues from a self-funded program are returned directly to the college. For most programs, tuition is established on a cost recovery basis, which is required under the law. Market rate tuition is charged for 18 programs at the University of Florida. Tuition for online graduate degree programs ranges from \$310 per credit hour for a Ph.D. in Audiology to \$1462 per credit hour for an MBA.

Before teaching an online course, faculty must complete workshops at the Faculty Institute, and teaching assistants must complete workshops at the Teaching Assistant Institute.

Performance measures are similar to those of other institutions, including graduation rates, student performance, cost viability, quality assurance, and post-graduate student success.

Dr. McCollough said UF has taken standards from Quality Matters and the Sloan Consortium to establish Markers of Excellence for the courses and programs.

Mr. Tripp asked if they expect the graduation rate to rise. Dr. Glover said the expectation for full-time online degree-seeking students is a four to six year graduation rate. While part-time online degree seeking students, including those who are working or have other obligations, are not expected to graduate within the same timeframe, students will be expected to make a certain amount of progress. Dr. Glover said performance needs to be evaluated based on both time and student success. A student who takes less than a full course load because of work or money, but earns good grades and enrolls consistently semester after semester, should be considered a success in the performance measures. He recommended that universities and the Board of Governors consider developing a measure for these students.

Vice Chair Morton asked if the university has integrated courses offered by Coursera into its offerings. Dr. McCollough said eight courses are currently offered through Coursera and another five are being added. Every course prepared for delivery through Coursera can be delivered on campus and online.

### g. Florida International University

Chair Lautenbach recognized Dr. Douglas Wartzok, Provost and Executive Vice President, from Florida International University. Dr. Wartzok introduced Dr. Ken Furton, Dean of the College of Arts and Sciences, Dr. Joyce Elam, Dean of University College, and Dr. Susan Clemmons, Associate Dean, Quality Assurance.

FIU has had significant growth in online learning during the last decade. Until recently, much of the growth has been organic, rather than strategic. The university is now shifting to a more strategic approach, with enrollment targets. This past year, online enrollment increased by 18%, while face-to-face enrollment only increased by 2%.

The university offered its first online graduate program in 2003 and its first online undergraduate program in 2004. In 2005, it established FIU Online and offered its entire core curriculum online. In 2009, the university launched its online MBA program, which today has 700 fully online students compared to 500 students in its face-to-face program.

In 2013, the university established a system to code cohorts of students as fully online. This past year, 5000 students took only online courses. Of those, 1000 were enrolled in fully online programs. In 2013-2014, 48% of students took an online course, and 23% of student credit hours were offered online.

The university has held 13 annual faculty development conferences for online education.

Dr. Wartzok said that, like the University of South Florida, FIU offers 13 fully online undergraduate degree programs. The fully online degree programs represent 19% of the undergraduate degree programs offered by the university. Almost all of these programs will be offered through Complete Florida and are state funded.

Florida International University offers a wide range of services to support online courses and programs, including marketing, recruitment, course design, technology support, student support (including coaching and online chats), faculty training, and quality assurance. The FIU Online organization does not receive state funding; it is funded through a distance learning fee.

The university used regional and national market research, enrollment and growth rate of online education in programs throughout the country, and guidance from external advisory groups to select the first 13 degree programs.

Mr. Tripp asked why enrollment in the education program is low. Dr. Wartzok said the workforce gap analysis indicated that the shortage of teachers was due to retention in the workforce, not with the number of teachers who graduate.

Fees for health, athletics, and parking are waived for fully online students. Blended students who take some courses online and some courses on campus pay \$256.92 per credit hour, compared to \$215.94 for students taking only online courses. The university charges a distance learning fee which has been reduced from \$66 per credit hour to \$53 per credit hour as the university has begun to achieve economies of scale. The university will continue to monitor this fee and intends to reduce it as appropriate.

Of graduate degree programs, 20% are offered online. Most of the programs are self-sustaining or charge market rate. Most are fully online, although two have some site-based requirements, such as nursing clinicals.

Performance measures include retention rate, graduation rate, student satisfaction, enrollment targets and similar outcome results.

The university has a detailed plan for online education over the next five years, including specific programs that will be offered online and enrollment targets for each dean.

Mr. Huizenga asked about enrollment projections for undergraduate students. Dr. Wartzok said that enrollment in undergraduate degree programs is projected to be 4000 by 2019-2020.

Ms. Link asked how many first-time-in-college students are fully online. Dr. Wartzok said the university just started tracking those students in 2013. Dr. Elam said, anecdotally, the first cohort was very small.

Chair Lautenbach asked how many people work on marketing in-house. Dr. Elam said they had 5 employees who work on marketing and about 20 employees in the call center.

### h. University of Central Florida

Chair Lautenbach recognized Dr. Joel Hartman, Vice Provost for Information Technologies & Resources and CIO at the University of Central Florida, who then introduced Dr. Diane Chase, Interim Provost, and Dr. John Hitt, President.

Dr. Hartman said that online education has become a substantial part of the University of Central Florida. The university has online undergraduate, graduate and certificate programs and offers a total of over 1,657 fully online courses; all general education requirements are available online. He said that 100 new online courses are developed annually. He said that UCF currently offers 15 undergraduate programs online, which would put them first in the SUS in terms of number of undergraduate programs offered online.

In addition, the university has several programs that are more than 50% online and may in the future have a strong likelihood of becoming fully online. Programs may have 100% of their courses online, but aren't classified as fully online, because the program may require student learning experiences on campus.

Dr. Hartman said that students mix and match fully online, blended, and classroom courses based on their individual needs, requirements and lifestyles.

Ms. Link asked if online students use facilities on campus. Dr. Hartman said many students use campus resources. President Hitt said some students live on campus, but only take online courses. Dr. Hartman said they were looking at offering courses at a greater distance in which case they would not charge the fees associated with campus facilities or services.

Over the years, faculty have incorporated technology into their classrooms. This past spring, almost half of classroom courses made substantive use of online tools and the learning management system.

Mr. Tripp asked if the blended courses reduced the amount of time a teacher spends on instruction. Dr. Chase said the time is the same or more, but the time is spent on different activities. She said blended courses allow faculty to reach more students, either in the classroom or online. Dr. Hartman said fully online and blended courses actually increase the work for faculty, but the work is distributed over time in different ways. Dr. Hitt said blended courses flip the percent of students who interact with faculty. In face-to-face courses, 15% to 20% of students might engage, but that number is flipped in the online environment. Many more students are likely to interact with faculty in an online format.

Nearly 36% of total student credit hours were generated by online and blended courses, and that percent has been increasing at a rate of 2% per year for the last several years. By 2021, the percent of student hours online is expected to be 50%. Online credit hours are growing faster than the on-campus credit hours. Summer enrollment in online courses is especially high.

Online education is rooted in the colleges and departments. The colleges and departments each have their own strategies for online education that is particular to their programs, demands, and enrollment, and the Center for Distributed Learning's job is to weave those strategies together for a cohesive university effort.

Chair Lautenbach asked if faculty and deans are on board. Dr. Hartman said many deans are on board and even if deans are not on board, the department chairs are and their colleges reflect a high level of activity in online education. Many of the colleges have more than 50% of their credit hours online.

Mr. Tripp asked if education degree programs work online. Dr. Hartman said some programs require on-ground experiences, but, overall, online activity in that degree program is still significant at UCF at this point.

All students pay the same tuition and fees for online, blended, and on-ground courses, with the exception being the five programs that are offered on a cost-recovery basis. An \$18 per credit hour distance learning fee is charged and used for developing and supporting online education.

Every faculty member is required to participate in extensive faculty development. Every faculty member is assigned an instructional designer who works with them throughout their tenure.

Mr. Tripp asked if UCF grades faculty members. Dr. Hartman said faculty who want to develop a course must complete and pass UCF's flagship faculty development course, which requires 80 hours in a blended format. Faculty who want to teach an existing course must take a course focused on the pedagogy, which requires a commitment of 35 hours.

Chair Lautenbach asked if faculty are participating. Dr. Hartman said 100 faculty participate annually and online education is now part of their culture. Dr. Chopra said faculty has fully embraced online education.

Dr. Hartman said that an analysis for five years of student survey data showed the highest satisfaction among students in a blended course, followed by fully online courses, and then face-to-face courses.

Data on student success shows online learning is comparable to face-to-face, while blended learning is superior to both.

Next steps are exploring adaptive, mastery-based learning; developing predictive analytics using big data; and developing alternative credentialing, such as badges; looking at nontraditional scheduling; and experimenting with MOOCs. UCF will also begin looking at taking some of its courses nationally, but will remain primarily focused on its students in central Florida.

Vice Chair Morton asked if UCF was evaluating data on postgraduate success and employer satisfaction. Dr. Hartman said the colleges and programs are collecting and evaluating that data. Vice Chair Morton indicated that it would be good for institutions systemwide to know about their online students, such as their ages, whether they are employed, who is looking for a change in job skills, etc. He asked if UCF checks on employer satisfaction. Dr. Hartman said that departments track the employment data, which is required for accreditation purposes, and he is not aware of any differences in employer satisfaction between graduates of online programs and graduates of face-to-face programs. He also indicated that UCF collects demographic data on its students. Dr. Chase mentioned that students are shifting between the modalities on a semester-by-semester basis.

Ms. Link said she found employers were not as satisfied with first-time-in-college students who were fully online in community colleges because they lacked the soft skills they needed to be successful.

### i. Florida State University

Chair Lautenbach recognized Dr. Susann Rudasill, Director, Office of Distance Learning at Florida State University.

The organizational structure for distance learning is centralized and reports to the Academic Affairs Provost. The budget for distance learning is also centralized.

The focus of distance education has been on graduate degree programs and certificates. The College of Education has the most online courses.

Mr. Tripp asked why the College of Education had been more successful in comparison to other universities. Dr. Rudasill said the College of Education was involved in distance education from the beginning and instructional designers and development faculty were originally from the College of Education.

Overall online enrollment is growing. Six years ago, 24% of students took at least one online course. This year, 58% took at least one online course. Distance learning fees are flexible and on a downward trend.

Total revenue was \$66 million last year. Of the revenue generated by distance learning fees, 85% is used to pay graduate students to mentor online students and for tuition waivers.

The strategic plan for distance learning ties in with the university's strategic plan.

Departments conduct their own market research and originate proposals for online degree programs. They must identify a need and the plan must be sustainable. A three-year business plan is required. Development and production of programs is centralized.

Chair Lautenbach asked if the whole process was bottom-up. Dr. Rudasill said the Departments needed to generate the proposal, but the proposal would need to align to the strategic plan to be implemented. She said that FSU has found it not to be successful to start a program from the top down.

Dr. Rudasill said that distance learning fees must not exceed the cost to develop and maintain the program or course. Revenues from distance learning fees are given directly to the departments. These fees are flexible and range from \$10 to \$210 per credit hour. Most distance learning fees are going down.

The university requires training for graduate students to mentor online. Instructors are not required to complete training before teaching online, but must complete training if they want to get paid for developing a course.

To measure performance, the university uses Quality Matters and student and faculty surveys.

Mr. Tripp asked if they have the ability to incorporate frequently asked questions into the course. Dr. Rudasill said all questions are recorded, and answers are provided in the course. Analytics are also used to improve the course content.

Mr. Tripp asked if the university had a five or ten year goal for online education. Dr. Rudasill said FSU has merged planning for online education into the university's work plan and are looking at expanding offerings. Focus has been on graduate programs but undergraduate demand is exploding and FSU will need to determine how to address that.

### j. University of North Florida

Chair Lautenbach recognized Dr. Len Roberson, Assistant Vice President of Technology at the University of North Florida. Dr. Roberson introduced Deb Miller, Director of the Center for Instruction & Research Technology.

While UNF has had online courses for many years, the focus for the last five to seven years has been on program development at both the undergraduate and graduate level. The university is using the distance learning fee to support the development and delivery of programs. The university has developed a distance learning strategic plan with 14 goals and many action items for the next five years.

Dr. Roberson said that the university has a centralized unit that supports distance learning while the degrees, programs and courses reside in the colleges. Six degree programs are offered online – one bachelor's, four Master's, one doctorate - and three certificate programs that are imbedded in graduate programs. Online courses are initiated by faculty. Programs and departments initiate the process for putting programs online and the proposal goes through the same process as a proposal for a new on-campus program. Tuition and fee policies are reflective of the needs of the program. The university has no unique policies for online tuition and fees. The university has programs that use standard tuition and fees, including the distance learning fee, market rate tuition, and cost recovery.

The university has a tiered approach to faculty development, but training is not mandated unless the centralized unit provides direct support. A new revised distance learning policy requiring training is under review.

The university uses standard performance measures. Faculty are evaluated by their department chairs. Last year, the university began a survey of distance learning courses, which indicated an 80% satisfaction rate.

Dr. Roberson said that developing policies is a goal for the future. Faculty have expressed significant concern about intellectual property rights for online content. For example, who owns the content of the online course developed with the support of the university – the university or the faculty? Mr. Tripp asked if faculty contracts are dealing with the issue. Dr. Roberson said the concern is what the contract states and how it is interpreted.

The university does have a strategic plan and is planning to increase online programs to ten by 2017 and increase the number of courses online.

### k. Florida Polytechnic University

Chair Lautenbach recognized Dr. Elhami Nasr, Associate Vice President of Academic Affairs. Dr. Nasr introduced Rick Maxey, Director of Governmental Affairs.

Online education will be a pillar in delivering undergraduate and graduate curriculum. Courses will be delivered in multiple modalities - face-to-face, hybrid and online. The offering will be based on demand.

The university has created an academic success center which is developing a methodology and approach to help students be successful online. Preparing faculty for online education is also a priority. Partnership and collaboration will be important.

Dr. Nasr said that the university's plan has three phases. Phase I is to use existing courses, particularly general education courses, available through the Florida Virtual Campus. Phase II is identifying courses through partnerships with other institutions that may be delivered in a hybrid format with some instruction on campus. Phase III is transitioning potential courses and programs to fully online.

### 1. New College of Florida

Chair Lautenbach recognized Dr. Stephen Miles, Provost and Vice President for Academic and Student Affairs. Dr. Miles introduced Dr. Brian Doherty, Dean of the Jane Bancroft Cook Library.

Dr. Miles said New College does not currently offer online courses, but technology features prominently in student learning.

Dr. Doherty said the Academic Resource Center supports both students and faculty. Faculty use distance learning technology in their classrooms. The learning management system used at New College is Moodle, which is hosted in the cloud. Many faculty use a flipped classroom model in which recorded lectures are viewed outside the classroom, which allows classroom time to be used for discussions. Skype, video conferencing, and lecture recordings are used. New College offers virtual tutoring and is beginning to discuss having an orientation online. Opportunities are provided for students to discuss MOOCs that they are taking from Coursera, edX, Udacity, and other deliverers of content. In addition, New College prepares students in how to learn online.

Dr. Miles said New College will be developing 3+2 and 4+1 programs with other institutions, and those programs will incorporate online courses.

### 4. Concluding Remarks and Adjournment

Chair Lautenbach thanked President Bradshaw and Dr. Toll for Florida Gulf Coast University hosting the meeting, and he thanked participants for their presentations. He said that the Committee would have a conference call before the June Board meeting to review what was learned during this meeting, conclusions that can be drawn, and how best to move forward.

Chair Lautenbach adjourned the meeting at 3:40 p.m.		
Ned Lautenbach, Chair		

Nancy C. McKee, Associate Vice Chancellor

# STATE UNIVERSITY SYSTEM OF FLORIDA BOARD OF GOVERNORS Innovation and Online Committee

June 9, 2014

**SUBJECT:** Discussion Regarding May 8, 2014, Committee Meeting

# PROPOSED COMMITTEE ACTION

Identification of issues for further exploration

### **AUTHORITY FOR BOARD OF GOVERNORS ACTION**

Article IX, Section 7, Florida Constitution

### **BACKGROUND INFORMATION**

On May 8, 2014, the Innovation and Online Committee held an all-day workshop at Florida Gulf Coast University to hear each university's current and planned program for online education.

Issues which were frequently mentioned during the presentations included:

- Faculty training
- Course development
- Program and course offerings
- Marketing
- Quality Metrics
- Learning Management Systems
- Strategic Planning

The focus of the Committee discussion during the conference call will be to identify the issues from the May 8 meeting that the Committee would like to explore at a future meeting or workshop.

Supporting Documentation Included:	None
Facilitators/Presenters:	Governor Lautenbach